



PATENT
Customer No. 22,852
Attorney Docket No. 08372.0005

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

In re Application of:)	
)	
Hongoh <i>et al.</i>)	Group Art Unit: 1763
)	
Application No.: 10/000,312)	Examiner: P. Hassanzadeh
)	
Filed: December 4, 2001)	Notice of Allowance Dated: April 26,
)	2004
For: PLASMA PROCESSING)	
APPARATUS)	

Mail Stop Issue Fee
Commissioner for Patents
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Sir:

COMMENT ON STATEMENT OF REASONS FOR ALLOWANCE

The above-identified application was allowed in the Notice of Allowance mailed April 26, 2004. The issue fee is being paid concurrently with this Comment.

With the Notice of Allowance, the Examiner provided a statement of reasons for allowance. The statement recites, "a microwave plasma processing apparatus including" a number of the claimed elements. The statement italicizes portions of the listed claim elements, including the clauses, "a ring-shaped supporting shelf protruding toward the center of the chamber" and "the supporting shelf has an inner periphery including a corner portion shaped into a **curve**." See Notice of Allowability, page 2 (emphasis in original).

Although Applicant agrees with the Examiner's ultimate conclusion that the claims are allowable, Applicants respectfully disagree with the apparent characterization the claim is allowable only for the recitation of the term "curve" and/or the recitation of the supporting shelf. Instead, Applicants submit that the claims are also allowable because, in addition to the reasons listed, the claims include other elements and subject matter not disclosed or suggested in the prior art. Therefore, the claims are allowable because of the combination of all the elements arranged as claimed, as expanded under the doctrine of equivalents.

If there is any fee associated with the filing of this Comment, please charge Deposit Account No. 03-1129.

Respectfully submitted,

FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,
GARRETT & DUNNER, L.L.P.

Dated: July 23, 2004

By: 

Dustin T. Johnson
Reg. No. 47,684